

Chairmen's Committee

Record of Meeting

Date: 24th July 2012

Present	Deputy T.A. Vallois, President Deputy S.G. Luce, Vice-President Senator S.C. Ferguson Deputy J.H. Young Deputy K.L. Moore
Apologies	Deputy J.M. Maçon
Absent	
In attendance	H.M. Attorney General (item 9 only) Mrs K. Tremellen-Frost, Scrutiny Manager

Ref Back	Agenda matter	Action
	1. Minutes of previous meetings The minutes of the meetings of 13th and 19th June and 10th July, having been approved, were accordingly signed. The Minutes of the 3rd July would be signed by the President once a minor error had been amended.	
	2. Panel Activity Reports These were noted.	
19.06.12 Item 3 513/35	3. Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP) The Committee noted the planning and timing chart for scrutiny of the MTFP by the main Panels and the Sub-Panel of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel. The timings for main Panel hearings were noted and it was further noted that ideally Panels would have submitted brief and concise reports to the Sub-Panel early August although the very latest date was 14th September. The Committee considered a number of timing issues and agreed that any issues which arose during the course of the Sub-Panel review needed to be raised as soon as possible. It was noted that the amendments to the MTFP had to be lodged on the same date as the lodging of the budget and the debate on the Health White Paper. The President would discuss these matters with the Chief Minister.	
516/34	4. Prison Review: Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel The scoping document for the above review was noted.	
516/33	5. Customs and Immigration Review: Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel The scoping document for the above review was noted.	

530/1(51)	<p>6. Skills Strategy Review</p> <p>The Committee noted that the Skills Strategy was shortly to be released and that this was an important document which would require scrutiny. Noting that, although it would be released by the Minister for Economic Development, this strategy cut across three Panels: Economic Affairs, Education and Home Affairs and Health, Social Security and Housing. The Committee considered which Panel would be the “parent” Panel given that the Chairman of the strategy group rotated between the three Ministers. There was also little information about when the strategy was due to be released and in what format. The President would discuss with the Chief Minister.</p>	TV
<p>13.06.12 Item 6</p> <p>510/1(45)</p>	<p>7. Effectiveness of public hearings</p> <p>Recalling that a Scrutiny Member had raised the above matter at the meeting of all Scrutiny Members on 13th June 2012, the Committee gave consideration to the proposal of requesting written documentation in advance of hearings so that this could be used to better prepare questions.</p> <p>The Committee noted that this process was generally advised by way of best practice, however, it was for individual Panels to decide their approach in relation to specific reviews. For this approach to be effective for quarterly hearings it would necessitate Panels being very specific about the areas it wished to question the Minister.</p> <p>The Committee agreed to express its thanks to the Scrutiny Member who had requested that this matter be discussed and to advise of the above.</p>	KTF
510/1(73)	<p>8. Evaluation of first session of Scrutiny – January to 30th June 2012</p> <p>The Committee received and noted a comprehensive report on all aspects of work covered by Scrutiny from January 2012 to end June 2012.</p> <p>The Committee was content with its achievements over the first six months and agreed that every effort should be made to continue to produce robust evidential reports in the future.</p> <p>The evaluation would be considered with the Council of Ministers at a joint meeting on 6th September 2012</p>	
<p>22.05.12 Item 7</p> <p>510/1(3)</p>	<p>9. Training – Questioning Skills: H.M. Attorney General and H.M. Solicitor General</p> <p>The Committee welcomed H.M. Attorney General and H.M. Solicitor General to the meeting in respect of a possibility of the Law Officer’s Department offering some training on questioning skills to Scrutiny Members.</p> <p>It was agreed that this initiative should receive more in-depth consideration by the Law Officer’s Department in conjunction with the Scrutiny Office. It was noted that it was unlikely that such training could be provided prior to Spring 2013.</p>	

	H.M. Attorney General and Solicitor General withdrew from the meeting. The Committee noted the good timing for this as an opportunity for refresher training following the phase 2 questioning/chairing training had already been agreed for October.	LoD/ KTF
510/1(72)	<p>10. Confidential documents: use of.</p> <p>The Committee considered a situation whereby information received in confidence by a former Scrutiny Member had been used in the States Assembly. It noted that the Privileges and Procedures Committee [PPC] had been asked to consider the matter and correspondence had been copied to the President.</p> <p>It concluded that the Member did breach the Confidentiality Agreement as stated in Appendix 1 of the Code of Practice for Scrutiny Panels and the PAC. The Confidentiality Agreement would have been signed in accordance with practice at that time. It was also of the opinion that there was little, if anything the Committee could do about this specific occurrence given that the Member was no longer a member of Scrutiny. Lastly it agreed that respect for confidentiality and actions in relation to related breaches were relevant to all States Members and not restricted to Scrutiny and the Committee was hopeful that the PPC would consider this in the round.</p> <p>The views of the Committee would be forwarded to the PPC for its forthcoming meeting the next day.</p>	KTF
24.04.12 Item 17	<p>11. Financial Report: second quarter</p> <p>The Committee received and noted the second quarter financial report.</p>	
13.06.12 Item 7 510/1(45)	<p>12. Hearings: Protocol for moving from public to private session</p> <p>The Committee noted that the principle of the protocol had been approved by all Scrutiny Members who had attended the all Scrutiny Member meeting on 13th June 2012.</p> <p>The final protocol was agreed and it was noted that this would be circulated to Departmental Scrutiny Liaison Officers to bring to the attention of Ministers and Departmental Officers.</p>	
	<p>11. Future meetings</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 6th September: meeting with Council of Ministers: 9.30am – 10.30am, 9th floor, Cyril Le Marquand House. Evaluation of first six months and way forward. Apologies: Senator Ferguson. The Chief Minister may also be unavailable – this will be checked; • 12th September: all Member meeting 1.00pm – 2.00pm Blampied Room; • 18th September: 9.30am-11.30am - Scheduled Chairmen's Committee meeting, Le Capelain Room 	